Date of Acceptance:

Available Online:

10 May 2022

27 May 2022



Exploring Ideologies in Primary English Textbook (SNC-2020): A Critical Discourse Analysis

Mamona Yasmin Khan(CA)

Associate professor Department of English The Women University Multan mamona.6231@wum.edu.pk

Abida Ali

Research Scholar Department of English The Women University Multan

Abstract

This research aims to investigate the various ideologies embedded within the language of the primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) of grades (1-3). It also inquires the supportive role of these ideologies for the children in the process to get an education. This is qualitative research, the data is collected from the primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) of grades (1-3). The latent qualitative content analysis under the theoretical framework of 3D CDA Modal (Fairclough, 2001) reveal the ethical and Pakistani cultural ideologies and themes. The findings show the prominent themes are ethics in home and school, discipline attitude and good manners the children follow in the culture of Pakistan. The sophisticated and positive attitude of the children in the social, home and educational institutions reflects ethical values as the prominent feature of productive positive social being. Moreover, the critical discourse analysis of the qualitative data uncovers the different ethical and Pakistani cultural ideologies. ideologies reflect the ethical and scheduled attitude of the children because they are shown to help the poor, share things, respect elders, be punctual and honest, keep cleanliness, does homework, save resources, play and study side by side. Consequently, this facilitates the process to get the education and the children get the idea from the textbooks to study at home along with following the ethical activities. The future researcher may explore the linguistic role of these textbooks to teach four skills of language.

Key words: Language, Ideology, Critical Discourse Analysis, Content analysis

1. Introduction

Language is a system of signs based on an organized structure and the comprehension of the deep structure aids to know the language. The sentences in the language are based on the proper structure and associated with the specific meaning. It gives voice to the ideas of the speaker and it reflects the perception about the social world (Fromkin et al., 2018). The ideas in the language define the ideology because it is the system of interpretation and practice in the social context. Thus, it is reflected in the linguistic behaviour of the speakers and it is the knowledge practised in the social relationship (Bisseret, 2011).

The textbook is the basic component in the system of education because it provides knowledge and ideologies to the recipient. These ideologies are not only associated with different social, ethical and cultural strands but also with intellectual ideas. These ideas exert influence over the students in an implicit manner and they understand the social and cultural phenomena in the light of the ideologies being presented in them (Curdt-Christiansen & Weninger, 2015). Furthermore, these are designed for pedagogic and didactic purposes because it provides intellectual knowledge and ideologies in the specific socio-cultural context. These are associated with the content structure in the textbooks because of the specific structure of the language within the discourse of education. Moreover, the series of researches prove the fact about the active engagement of the children with the textbooks. So, they interact with the different types of texts to draw out the meaning in a specific social context and the instructor provides aid to them to comprehend the text in discourse (Luke, Carrington & Kapitzke, 2013).

The ideology is considered an abstract belief system as it relates to the specific choice of language to promote the intended ideas. The ideas in the language influence the comprehension process of the receiver and it shapes the belief system of the people. The choice of the linguistic features is in harmony with the ideas of the language users because it reflects and influences the behaviour of the recipient. Thus, language represents the ideology in society, and it reflects the values, norms and experiences of the people in the various settings (McGroarty, 2010).

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The textbooks are loaded with multiple ideologies and they influence the worldviews of the readers. The children read textbooks at home and school. They are the prime exposer to these ideologies. These ideologies direct the activities and the attitude of the children as young learners. This is important to inquire about these ideologies in the textbooks because these are the powerful official source of knowledge for the readers and influence their perception. This study investigates the ideologies in the revised primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) from the academic year (2021-22) of grades (1, 2 & 3). So, the various ideologies in the selected textbooks are investigated to uncover their supportive role in the process to get an education for the children.

1.3 Objectives

This research aims to investigate the various ideologies embedded within the language of the primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) of grades (1-3). It also inquires the supportive role of these ideologies for the children in the process to get an education.

1.4 Research Ouestion

1.What linguistic choices are used in the Primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) to convey various ideologies and their supportive role for children in the process of education?

1.5 Significance of the Study

This study is significant at the pedagogical, practical and theoretical levels. It may be helpful for the disciples of the subject of Education. This assists them to make philosophical ideas in education because it provides the practical picture of ideologies in them. This raises the critical consciousness of the readers and it is also an addition to the theoretical knowledge from this perspective.

2. Literature Review

The critical discourse analysis of the English textbooks shows the denunciation of the imperialism of the foreign language and promotes the communist ideology. The English language textbook producers use language to promote the desired ideology and use language as an agent to produce it (Hallett, 2021). Furthermore, the ideology in the textbooks is used to socialize the children and raise

their critical consciousness about the various problems in the social environment. The ideology in the educational discourse not only do the social training of the children but also develops their perception about the environment and the social world around them (Curdt-Christiansen, 2021). Thus, in the age of globalization, the foreign language is rich in knowledge and used to communicate at the international level. The English language is taught to the children to enable them to get access to vast knowledge (Ping, 2015).

In the English textbooks at the primary level, the moral ideology is dominant to teach values to the young learners. These moral values are defined as helping others, using polite words and the caring attitude of the children towards the other social being. The basic motif of the author behind such ideology in the textbook is to teach moral values to children at an early age. (Sulistiyo et al., 2020). Moreover, the ideology about the culture and language is single faceted in the heritage textbooks and these are produced by the Chinese and Korean governments. The inquiry demands knowledge about the different dimensions of culture and language. Hence, these editions in the language textbooks may assist overseas readers (Sun & Kwon, 2020).

The gendered ideology is present in the Vietnamese English textbooks despite the efforts of the textbook producer to reduce this in the educational discourse. In these language textbooks, the male is presented as dominant and more social as compared to the females in society. Moreover, a male is more vocal, independent than a female because she is less vocal and does not possess the material resources (Vu & Pham, 2021). The men are shown in the visual and linguistic content involved in outdoor activities and they are shown to get higher education as compared to females (Yonata & Mujiyanto, 2017). The males in the images are shown to engage in the technical professionals such as doctors or architecture but females are represented in non-technical jobs such as nurse and teaching (Shamsuddin et al., 2015). Thus, the gendered differences are present in the textbooks but efforts are being made to minimize the aspect from the educational discourse.

The language of the primary English textbook of Punjab textbook board publishers is analyzed. It shows sexist language is present in the vocabulary, structure of sentences, illustration, themes and meanings also. Although, female representation is recessive because they are shown in kinship relations their depiction at the public level is in the traces. This is shown in the language to pronounce the female's name generally among all the people is barred. Thus, males are depicted as dominant and prominent in the content as compared to females. The use of language in this manner creates differences among the people in the society and it needs to be corrected. The sexist free language is need to be used in the educational content because it may cast a healthy effect on the perception of the readers. This may also reduce the differences among them and create harmony at the societal level (Rasool, Asif & Anwar, 2019).

In Canada, the primary English textbooks show ethnicity in a distorted form and it reflects racism. This sort of racist view in the textbooks may become harmful for the cognition of the children. Thereupon, in the multiethnic society, all ethnicities need to be represented equally without discrimination one over the other. So, the equal representation of all the ethnicities in the textbooks may create a sense of harmony and equality among the human being in the society and will reduce the element of violence from the multiethnic society. The investigator admits the fact about these sorts of ideas may be constructed unconsciously by the textbooks producers. The motif is to highlights such issues in the reading content and draws the attention of the authorities towards the possible outcome. It may stimulate the editors to review the content and eliminate the problem (Bassani, 2015).

In England schools, it is included in the language policy to teach their pupils the manner and mannerisms. It deals with the way to communicate with the teachers and with one another. It is taught to them to speak in full-length sentences and to use slang words is not appreciated by the educational staff on the premises of the school. This is their method to teach their students the manner to communicate with other students and their teacher because the policymakers want their students to leave the gate after getting the ethical manners. Educational institutions play a significant role to teach language skills to the learners and also in the manner to use them properly in the appropriate situation (Cushing, 2020).

This is found out the previous studies investigate the primary English textbooks from the perspective of sexist language, gender differences in the visual and written language. Furthermore, the element of ethnicity, the racism ideology, the representation of static culture and language in the heritage textbooks are revealed in the different countries. Thus, it is revealed the studies are conducted on the various perspectives in the primary textbooks but the primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) are under-discovered from the perspective of the Pakistani cultural and ethical ideologies and the ultimate influence on the children. The researcher investigates this aspect in these textbooks under the 3D CDA modal (Fairclough, 2001).

2.1 Theoretical Framework

Critical Discourse Analysis Modal by Fairclough (2001)

This three-dimensional modal is based on the concept which states the use of language is a social exercise that is in a specific context. Society shapes the language and language forms the social world which serves the interest of some people while ignoring others (Janks, 1997). Thus, the three inter-related processes of analysis of discourse are as follows;

A. Description-Text Analysis

The structure of the text is analyzed at the level of lexis choice (vocabulary and metaphors), grammar (clause, sentence and modality) and cohesion.

B. Interpretation-Discourse Practice Analysis

It deals with the production, distribution and consumption of text which is produced in a specific context. This dimension of the modal is based on intertextuality which is the presence of the snatches of the text in the main text of the analysis. The two types of intertextuality are as follows:

• Manifest Intertextuality:

This is shown explicitly in the main text through quotation marks.

• Constitutive Intertextuality

This is the incorporation of the text into the main text out of discourse order.

C. Explanation- Social Practice Analysis

This refers to the three socio-cultural aspects of the discourse explanation at social, political and cultural levels. Fairclough argued that it is not necessary to explain discourse at all levels. It can be explained at one level to explain the target issue in the

context (Sheyholislami, 2001). Thus, the researcher explains the educational discourse at the cultural level which deals with the issues of values.

3. Methods and Material

In this qualitative investigation, the researcher collects data from the primary English textbooks (SNC-2020) from grades (1-3) of the academic year (2021-22). The sample of ten passages is selected by using the purposive sampling technique from grade one, two and three primary English textbooks respectively. The qualitative data is analyzed by using latent content analysis, a technique in qualitative data analysis.

4. Data Analysis

The researcher takes ten excerpts from the Primary English Textbook (SNC-2020) of grades (1-3). The latent qualitative content analysis reflects the following extracted themes:

Sr.				
No.	Condensed	Code	Category	Extracted
	Meaning			Theme
1.	The activities	Academic	Ethics and	Ethics in
	at school and	routine.	Culture.	School and
	home. The	Curricular		Home
	ethical	activities		Culture
	behaviour of	ethics.		
	the student			
	ispunctuality,			
	cleanliness and			
	playing with			
	siblings.			
2.	Students	Manner	Ethical	Disciplined
	follow certain	obedience	Behaviour.	Attitude at
	principles at	Cleanliness		School
	school in the	Sharing		
	classroom such	Magic words		
	as cleanliness,	Respect		
	sharing of			
	things, using			
	polite words,			

respect, and being obedient to the teacher. 3. The mother is teaching her son to behave well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They
to the teacher. 3. The mother is teaching her son to behave well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They The mother is Sharing Ethical Behaviour Good Behaviour Cultural Cultural celebration and Cultural celebration and Creative and Cultural Creative and Cultural celebration and Creativity Celebrations Creative Art and Cultural celebration and Creativity Celebrations Creative Art and Cultural Creative and Cultural Celebrations Creativity Creative and Cultural Creativity Celebrations
3. The mother is teaching her son to behave well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They Sharing a Behaviour Cultural Behaviour Cultural Cultural celebration and Creative to cleanliness Creative Art and Cultural celebration and Creativity Creative Art and Cultural celebration and Creativity Creative Art and Cultural celebrations Creativity Creative Art and Cultural Creative and Cultural Celebrations Creativity Creative Art and Cultural Creative and Cultural Celebrations
teaching her son to behave well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They They son to behave well and Behaviour Behaviour Good Behaviour Cultural celebration and Cultural celebration and Cultural Creativity Creative Art and Cultural celebration and Creativity Creative Art celebration and Cultural Celebrations Creativity Creative Art and Cultural celebration and Cultural Creativity Creativity Creative Art and Cultural Celebrations Creativity Creative Art and Cultural Art and Cultural Celebrations Creative Art and Cultural Art and Cultural Art and Cultural Art and Cultural Art and Celebrations Creativity Creative Art and Cultural Art Art and Cultural Art Art and Cultural Art Art Art Art Art Art Art Art Art Ar
son to behave well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They
well and develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
develops the habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
habit of sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
sharing things. 4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
4. Creative and cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
cultural work on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Culture room and Culture in Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
on religious events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They Cleanliness and Creativity Creativity Culture room Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
events. They celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They Creativity Creativity Creativity Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
celebrate it and follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They Culture room Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
follow the principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and arrangement of things in the room. They follow the principles of cleanliness. Culture room Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
principles of cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They Culture room Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
cleanliness. 5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They Cluture room Culture in Pakistan manners at Home
5. Orientation and Sophisticated arrangement of things in the room. They
and arrangement of things in the room. They
arrangement of things in the room. They
things in the room. They
room. They
discuss the
topics, share
things and
follow
principles of
cleanliness.
6. Kaleem finds Childish wish Ethics Honesty a
Asim's colour Be Honest Feature of
pencil box in Moral
his bag. He is Character
happy to see it
but his mother
says him to be
honest and he
returns it to

	Asim.			
7.	He follows	Physical	Ethics and	Productive
	good habits for	health	Culture	Behaviour of
	Physical	Respect		a Child
	health. He	Elders		
	respects his	Study at		
	elders and	Home		
	assists not only	Saves and		
	his parents but	Share Things		
	also others. He			
	does his			
	homework on			
	time and saves			
	electricity by			
	sharing things.	7	.	
8.	Family support	Family	Family	Family Role
	the children in	Support	and	in Training
	their	Child Skill	Training	of a Child
	development		of children	
	of abilities and			
	teach them the difference			
	between right			
	and wrong.			
9.	Routine from	The	The	Schedule the
'•	home to school	scheduled	scheduled	Day of a
	in a day of a	day	routine	child
	child as a	auj	Toutine	Cilita
	student.			
10.	Culture is the	LifeStyle	Cultural	Pakistani
	representation	Pakistani	Reflection	Culture and
	of our manners	Culture	and	Mannerism
	and style of	Family and	Family in	
	living.	Respect	Pakistan	
	Pakistani			
	culture reflects			
	respect and			
	love towards			

elders and they
live as a
family.

5. Report the Findings

The latent qualitative content analysis of the primary English textbook reveals the various cultural and ethical themes in the social context of Pakistan. The prominent themes are ethics in home and school, discipline attitude and good manners the children follow in the culture of Pakistan. The sophisticated and positive attitude of the children in the social, home and educational institutions reflects ethical values as the prominent feature of productive positive social being. Furthermore, the Pakistani cultural values of the family as a social institution and its role in the training and promotion of the norms and values of the standard culture to the next generation are highlighted. Moreover, the critical discourse analysis of the qualitative data uncovers the different ethical and Pakistani cultural ideologies. These ideologies reflect the ethical and scheduled attitude of the children because they are shown to help the poor, share things, respect elders, be punctual and honest, keep cleanliness, do homework, save resources, play and study side by side. Besides, the Pakistani cultural ideologies are reflected such as the younger are shown to engage in the celebration of the traditional norms and the elders are vigilant to teach them the cultural norms and ethical values. Thus, these ideologies in the primary English textbooks are practised among children in the educational setting in Pakistan. The discourse not only shapes or reshapes the social structure and vice versa but the ideologies in them also produce effects at the situational, institutional and societal levels (Fairclough, 2001).

The ideology in harmony with the existing knowledge is normative and the relation of the participant to it facilitates the situation for the practitioner of the discourse to perform well. The readers understand easily the situation because they get familiar with it by using background knowledge. The vivid depiction of the situation, the participants involved and the relation between them make clear to the readers the norms and values according to the type of the discourse (Fairclough, 2001). Furthermore, this concrete relation between the background knowledge and the situation presented

makes the idea clear to the discourse practitioner. In this case, the ethical and Pakistani cultural ideologies not only assist them to get a moral education but also facilitate them to get an intellectual education. The participant in the discourse is shown to be involved in the ethical activities and it introduces the children to the ideology to perform in this manner. The participant is depicted as punctual and goes to school and does the homework. Consequently, this facilitates the process to get an education and the children get the idea from the textbooks to study at home along with the obedience to ethical activities.

The selected passage from the educational discourse represents the educational and cultural activities of the participant as a student and child at home according to the social order of Pakistan. Furthermore, the activities of the participant as a student and as a child are depicted at school and home and is associated with cultural and ethical ideology in the society of Pakistan. The manners to eat, punctuality of time, social positive behaviour at home and doing homework then play promote the view to become productive being in society. Moreover, in the social institution of the family, the elders are in the position of power and they use this for the productive training of the children in the social context. The normative power relation in the family portrays the ethical ideology at the situational and social levels. Thus, the presence of this ideology in the textbooks develops the child's attitude positively.

The ideology of mannerism the children follow within the social institution of the family. In the textbooks, it influences the perception of the children in the educational institution and at the social level. The mother is in the authoritative position and guides the child on the difference between right and wrong. It portrays and maintains the ethical ideology at the social and educational levels. Thus, in the educational institution, the social relation between the participants expresses the cultural activities.

The power relation between the participant in the educational setting works on equal levels and it is present in the textbooks. The cultural and ethical ideology is portrayed in the discourse and it aims to inform the young generation about the norms and ethics of the Pakistani culture. The elders are in the authoritative position in

the relational situational context and they use it to support and guide their children to make them productive beings of society.

The ethical ideology is portrayed and maintained in the textbooks. This guides the behaviour and activities not only at home and school but also in society and it produces a good social effect. The ethical ideology is portrayed and maintained in the textbooks and casts a positive impact on the attitude of the children. The situational context is cultural in Pakistani society because the younger and elders are involved in ethical and cultural activities. The passage reflects the Pakistani cultural ideology and the ethical norms and traditions are strong in the power perspective. Thus, this ideology in the textbooks casts a positive impact on the children at the educational, social and behavioural levels.

Conclusion

This study explores the various ethical and Pakistani cultural themes and ideologies such as ethics in school and home, discipline attitude and good manners the children follow in the culture of Pakistan. The sophisticated and positive attitude of the children in the social, home and educational institutions reflects ethical values as the prominent feature of productive positive social being. Furthermore, the elders are shown as active agents to transmit the cultural and moral values among the children and teach them the difference between right and wrong. The children are represented as they follow the family rules and ethical and traditional values. they are punctual and go to school, study at home and discuss their ideas with one another in the cultural setting in Pakistan. This presents a practical picture to the children and they get the idea to study at home. They get not only the intellectual knowledge in this manner but also educate themselves at the ethical level because they get the ethical ideas from these textbooks.

Future Implications

This study is beneficial for the future researcher because the present research inquires about the primary English textbook (SNC-2020) from the angle of Pakistani cultural and ethical ideologies. The upcoming scholars may explore the role of these textbooks to impart the four skills of language by viewing critically the linguistic exercises in them. Thus, the ideology in the upcoming Elementary (SNC) based may be found in future.

References

- Ahmed, N., Manzoor, S., Faisal, Dr., A., Sadiq, A., Tariq, M., Jaleel, Prof., R., Raees, Y., & Sarfraz, D. (2021). English Grade-2 Based on Single National Curriculum 2020. Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore.
- 2. Bassani, C. (2015). Ethnic Representation in Canadian Primary English Textbooks.
- **3.** Bisseret, N. (2011). *Education, class language and ideology* (Vol. 167). Routledge.
- 4. Curdt-Christiansen, X. L. (2021). Environmental literacy: raising awareness through Chinese
- 5. primary education textbooks. *Language*, *Culture and Curriculum*, *34*(2), 147-162.
- 6. Curdt-Christiansen, X. L., & Weninger, C. (Eds.). (2015). Language, ideology and education: The politics of textbooks in language education. Routledge.
- 7. Cushing, I. (2020). 'Say it like the Queen': the standard language ideology and language policy making in English primary schools. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 1-16.
- 8. Fairclough, N. (2001). *Language and power*. Pearson Education. America.
- 9. Fromkin, V., Rodman, R., & Hyams, N. (2018). *An introduction to the language*. Cengage Learning.
- 10. Hallett, R. W. (2021). An examination of EFL textbooks in Lithuania. *Journal of Multicultural Discourses*, 16(3), 210-226.
- 11. Hagai, S., Kitamura, Y., Ratha, K. V., & Brehm, W. C. (2017). Ideologies Inside Textbooks.
- 12. In (Re) Constructing Memory: Education, Identity, and Conflict (pp. 49-73). Brill Sense.
- 13. Janks, H. (1997). Critical discourse analysis as a research tool. *Discourse: studies in the cultural politics of education*, 18(3), 329-342.
- 14. Luke, A., Carrington, V., & Kapitzke, C. (2013). *Textbooks and early childhood literacy* (Doctoral dissertation, Sage).
- 15. McGroarty, M. E. (2010). 1. Language and Ideologies. In *Sociolinguistics and language education* (pp. 3-39). Multilingual Matters.
- Nadeem, Dr., S., Zaka, R., Mahmood, Prof., K., Raees, Y., Faisal, Dr., A., Sarfraz, D., & Sadiq, A. (2021). English Grade-3 Based on Single National Curriculum 2020. Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore.

- 17. Ping, Q. (2015). Ideologies in primary English textbooks in China. In *Language*, *Ideology and Education* (pp. 177-194). Routledge.
- 18. Rasool, S., Asif, S. I., & Anwar, B. (2019). Voicing Sexism: Reflections from the Primary Level English Textbooks of Government Schools in Punjab. *Kashmir Journal of Language Research*, 22(2), 1-15.
- 19. Sulistiyo, U., Supiani, S., Kailani, A., & Lestariyana, R. P. D. (2020). Infusing moral content into primary school English textbooks: A critical discourse analysis. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(1), 251-260.
- 20. Sun, W., & Kwon, J. (2020). Representation of monoculturalism in Chinese and Korean heritage language textbooks for immigrant children. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, *33*(4), 402-416.
- 21. Shamsuddin, C. M., Keong, Y. C., & Hamid, B. A. (2015). Gender Stereotyped Images of Occupations in Malaysian Primary English Textbooks: A Social Semiotic Approach. *Arab World English Journal*, 6(4).
- 22. Sheyholislami, J. (2001). Critical discourse analysis. *Retrieved March* 10, 2009.
- 23. Vu, M. T., & Pham, T. T. T. (2021). Still in the shadow of Confucianism? Gender bias in contemporary English textbooks in Vietnam. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 1-21.
- 24. Yonata, F., & Mujiyanto, Y. (2017). The representation of gender in English textbooks in Indonesia. *Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature*, 12(1), 91-102.
- Zafar, M., Faisal, Dr., A., Sadiq, A., Tariq, M., Jaleel, Prof., R., Raees, Y., & Sarfraz, D. (2021). English Grade-1 Based on Single National Curriculum 2020. Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore.